Review of the Application of IQF in Several Studies on Growth-Development of Children*

Buchari Lapau

Hang Tuah Institute of Health, Riau Sumatra, Indonesia

IQF is Indonesian Qualification Framework consisting of 9 levels of competence. The competence as described in Master and Doctoral thesis are equivalent to the 8th and 9th levels of IQF. Their competences are (1) to develop scientific knowledge producing innovative work for Master degree, and original or creative work for Doctoral degree; and (2) to solve the problem of science through inter or multi discipline for Master degree, and inter, multi and trans discipline for Doctoral degree. The objective of this review is to identify how far the results of several studies on growth and development of children published in Scientific Journal describe the competence of researchers in the application of the 8th and/or 9th levels of IQF. To fulfil the competence, the researcher should conduct systematic study in term of continuation of thinking starting from title, objective, methods (type of design, population and sample, and data analysis), results, discussion on quality and accuracy of data, causal relationship, implication, conclusion of study followed by recommendation and suggestion. The implication uses the result of causal relationship directed to conclusion and recommendation. Conclusion contains development of knowledge, while recommendation contains how to solve the finding problems. Based on the recommendation, suggestion is formulated through inter, multi discipline producing innovative work for Master degree, and through inter, multi and trans discipline producing creative and original work for Doctoral degree. Eleven studies on growth-development of children published in scientific journal were reviewed, one or more of them indicate (1) The type of design is not relevant to objective of study; (2) There was no statement of population and sample; (3) Calculation of sample size was not based on the type of design; and (4) there was no discussion on quality and accuracy of data, causal relationship and implication of study. As a conclusion, IQF has not been applied fully, because of problem in research methods, which link with IQF. Hopefully, the readers are stimulated to attempt how they have competence according to the level 8 or 9 of IQF.

Keywords: qualification, research method, implication of study, recommendation, suggestion

Introduction

Indonesian Qualification Frame (IQF) is “Kerangka Kualifikasi Nasional Indonesia” (KKNI), which consists of 9 levels. The 8th level of IQF is equivalent to Master degree and the 9th level of IQF is equivalent to

* **Acknowledgement:** Special thanks go to Mr. Zainal Abidin MD, MPH as Rector of STIKes HTP and Mr. Marlis Saleh, S. Sos as Treasurer of Hang Tuah Foundation, who decided for financial support to the implementation of study, presentation in the International Conference on Education and Social Sciences 2015 (INTCESS'15) held in Istanbul, Turkey, and publication in the Journal: PSYCHOLOGY RESEARCH, New York, USA. I also thank Mr. Kamalizaman MSc, who assists me in technical writing.

Buchari Lapau, professor, medical doctor, public health specialist and epidemiologist, Hang Tuah Institute of Health.

Doctoral degree (*Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Tinggi*, 2011). Based on the 8th level of IQF, those having Master degree have 2 out of 3 following competences:

- (1) They are able to develop knowledge, technology, and/or art in their scientific field or professional practice through research producing innovative and tested work;
- (2) They are able to solve the problem of science, technology, and/or art in their scientific field or professional practice through inter or multidiscipline approach.

Based on the 9th level of IQF, those having Doctoral degree have 2 out of 3 competences:

- (1) They are able to develop the new knowledge, technology and/or art in their scientific field or professional practice through research producing creative, original and tested work;
- (2) They are able to solve the problem of science, technology, and/or art in their scientific field or professional practice through inter, multi and trans discipline approach.

Usually, those graduated as Master and Doctor work as College or University Lecturer, who have to develop their career in academic position starting from “assisten ahli” (expertise assistance), “lector” (lecturer), “lektor kepala” (senior lecturer) and “professor” (the highest), for which they need to have credit point through publication of their scientific paper in Scientific Journal.

The objective of this literature review is to identify how far the results of several studies on growth and development of children published in Scientific Journal describe the competence of researchers in the application of the 8th and the 9th levels of IQF.

Methods

This is the review of 11 studies concerning growth and development of children namely on improving growth (Lestari, Lilisianawati, Bardosono, Lestarina, & Salimo, 2012), working memory (Nugroho, Lestari, Salimo, Dewi, Adhim, & Lestarina, 2010), growth velocity (Lyfia, Deliana, Hakimi, Rosdiana, & Lubis, 2009), cognitive outcome (Setyorini, Umboh, & Haksari, 2010), development delay (Iskandar, 2010), language and visual motor (Samsudin, 2009), obesity (Laila, 2012) academic achievement (Pardede, Windiastuti, & Tridjja, 2009), language development (Yuridyah, Soedjarmiko, & Sastroasmoro, 2009), language development (Rano, 2009) and cognitive intelligence (Montolalu, Tangkilisan, & Nelly, 2009).

The review of each study is in the application of systematic research conducted in term of continuation of thinking starting from title, objective, methods, results, discussion, and conclusion of study followed by recommendation and/or suggestion; it means there is continuation or relationship of several aspects between the title and the following chapters (Lapau, 2013). The section of method consists of type of study design, population and sample, data collection and data analysis. The type of study design is formulated based on study objective.

The title of research consists of 4 components namely problem situation, the determinants of problem situation, place and time. The problem situation is the most important among the four components, which always appear to some extent consistently in the next chapters namely Introduction, Literature Review, Research Plan or Design, the Results of Study, Discussion, and Conclusion, Recommendation and Suggestion. The appearance of the four components in the following chapters is called the Red Line in Research Protocol (Lapau, 2015) which is the most important in every research.

The chapter of Introduction consists of several sections namely background, formulation of research problem, research objective, social and scientific significance of study, and steps and research design. Formulation of research problem is based on the background. The content of research problem in the form of

research question is the same as the content research objective formulated in the form of statement sentence. Social significance of study is the use of information from achievement of objective for solution of problem situation, while scientific significance of research is the use of hypothesis proof for development of scientific knowledge. It means that researcher thinks consistently starting from background, formulation of research problem, objective of study, social and scientific significance of study. The last section in the Introduction namely the Steps and Research Design is the bridge between the Introduction and Literature Review and Research Design.

The chapter of Literature Review consists of several sections namely detail information concerning problem situation, factors associating with problem situation, theoretical framework, conceptual framework, and specific research problem. The section of factors associating with problem situation consists of (1) theory namely clarification why each factor associating with problem situation; and (2) the result of previous research concerning association between the factor and the problem situation. All of theories' and the result of previous research are synthesized to be theoretical framework. Theoretical framework is hypothetic association between one or more factors and one problem situation. Conceptual framework is hypothetic association between one or more independent variable and one dependent variable. So, there is connection between theoretical framework and conceptual framework. In this case, an independent variable is operational of a factor. If some factors cannot become independent variables, the number of independent variables in the conceptual framework is less than factors in the theoretical framework. The independent variables in the conceptual framework become independent variables in specific research problem. Because of some limitations, the data concerning certain independent variables in the conceptual framework cannot be collected in the field; as a consequence the number of independent variables in the specific research problem is less than the number of independent variable in the conceptual framework.

The chapter of Research Plan or Design consists of several sections namely specific objectives, hypothesis, research design, population and sample, and processing and analysis of data. The content of specific objectives formulated in the form of statement sentence is the same as specific research problem written in the chapter of Literature Review. Specific objectives are continued by hypothesis, which consists of hypothesis statement, several sub-hypotheses, supporting hypothesis and operational definition. The contents of specific objective are the same as hypothesis, but the difference is that specific objectives have to be achieved, while hypothesis has to be proved. Hypothesis is statement concerning the association between several independent variables and one dependent variable, while sub-hypothesis is the statement between one independent variable and one dependent variable. Supporting hypothesis shows the references written in the form of (last name of author, year) based on theory and results of previous research for each factor associating with one problem situation. Operational definition concerns with the dependent variable and each independent variable, followed by level of measurement scale (nominal, ordinal, interval and ratio) and category for nominal and ordinal scale.

The type of Research Design written by those studying for Master and Doctoral degree is analytic quantitative research useful to prove hypothesis, or qualitative research useful to generate hypothesis. Both of them is necessary to develop scientific knowledge, as one prerequisite for level 8 and level 9 of IQF. The analytic quantitative research design consists of several types of study design namely analytic cross sectional study, case control study, prospective or retrospective cohort studies, before and after with control study, randomized clinical trial, and randomized community trial.

Population and sample consist of calculation of sample size and the procedure of taking representative sample from the population (Fisher, 1983); it means that the result of sample can be generalized to the population. Calculation of sample size is based on the type of study design (WHO, 1986). If the size of sample is less than what should be, α error and β error become higher, that decrease the validity of the result of study. The collection of data is excluded from this review, because it is more substantial than methodical. But the method of data analysis, which consist analysis of one variable, analysis of two variables, and analysis of multiple variables are included in this review. The result of study is actually the result of analysis; the result of analysis of two variables is not conclusive, while the result of multiple variables analysis is more conclusive and it is followed by discussion of causal relationship.

The chapter of discussion is concerned with quality and accuracy of data, causal relationship, and implication of study (Lapau, 2013). Quality of data consists of relevancy and validity of data, while accuracy of data consists of relevance, validity and reliability of data (Lapau, 2012). Relevance of data means that whether collected and analyzed data are full enough and relevant to achieve the study objective and prove hypothesis. Validity of data consists of internal and external validity. Internal validity is opposite of systematic error and random error. Systematic error consists of selection, information and confounding bias, while random error consists of α error and β error.

Causal relationship is discussed based on the result of analysis of multiple variables, which identify exposure and confounding variable statistically. Causal relationship between the exposure and the dependent variable is based on Hill criteria (Beaglohole, Bonita, & Kjellstrom, 1993), if the types of design used by researcher are “case control study” and “cross sectional study”. Types of study design which directly produce causal relationship are observational study namely “prospective and retrospective cohort studies” and intervention study namely “before and after with control study, randomized clinical trial” and “randomized community trial”.

Implication of study is to use the result of causal relationship for recommendation; it means that the researcher recommends preventing the causal factor. Then based on the recommendation, suggestion is formulated through “inter or multi-discipline” approach producing “scientific knowledge development” and “innovative work” (Lapau, 2013). These are what expected by IQF. Thus chapter of conclusion and recommendation/suggestion has to be based on the chapter of discussion especially the section of implication of study.

Results

Table 1 shows that (1) The types of design of study number 1, 2 and 3 are based on the objective of study, but the type of design of study number 4, 5 and 6 are not based on the objective of study; for example for study number 6, the objective of study should be as follows: to examine exclusive breast feeding as the cause of language and visual motor development; (2) For the study from number 1 to number 6, there were no statement about population, calculation of sample size and the procedure of taking sample from the population, except for the research number 5, there is statement on calculation of sample size for which α error = 5% and power = 80%.

Table 2 shows that (1) The type of design of study number 7 is not based on the objective of study, because the objective indicate causal relationship, while “case control study” cannot produce causal relationship directly; each type of design of study number 8 to 11 is based its own objective; and (2) In each study number 7 to 11, there was no statement of population, calculation of sample size, and the procedure of taking sample from the population.

Table 1

The Title of Study by Objective and Methods (Type of Design, Population and Sampling)

No	Title of study	Objective of study	Methods	
			Type of design	Population and sampling
1	Reduced serum zinc levels while improving growth of underweight school children in trial of zinc fortified milk	To evaluate the effect of milk fortification with zinc on serum zinc levels in underweight Indonesian school children	Randomized double blind community trial	No statement of population, calculation of size of sample, and procedure of sample
2	Effect of iron and zinc on working memory of underweight poor urban school children	To determine the effect of milk fortified with iron and zinc in memory of underweight urban school children	Randomized blind controlled trial	The same as number 1
3	Growth velocity in elementary school children iron deficiency anemia after iron therapy	To study the effect of iron therapy on growth velocity in children with iron deficiency anemia	Randomized clinical trial study	The same as number 1
4	Cognitive outcome in late preterm baby measured by Mullen scale in three months age	To compare cognitive outcome between late preterm and full term babies at three months age	Cohort study	The same as number 1
5	Correlation between hyper-bilirubin-aemia and development delay in 2-4 years old children	To investigate relationship between in term infants and development delay in 2-4 years old children	Retrospective cohort study	Sample size was estimated by using α error 5%, power 80%, and predicted correlation 0,35 No statement about population and no sampling procedure
6	Comparison of language and visual motor development between exclusively breastfed infants through cognitive adaptive test/ clinical linguistic, and auditory milestone scale	To compare the language and visual motor development between exclusively breastfed and non exclusively breastfed infants	Historical cohort study	No statement of population, calculation of size of sample and sampling procedure

Table 2

The Title of Study by Objective and Methods (Type of Design, Population and Sampling)

No	Title of study	Objective of study	Methods	
			Type of design	Population and sampling
7	Breastfeeding and decreased for childhood obesity	To determine influence of infant breastfeeding practice on risk of obesity in children aged 6 to 8 years	Case control study	No statement of population, no calculation of size of sample and sampling procedure
8	Relationship between obesity and cognitive intelligence in junior high school students	To determine the relationship between obesity and cognitive intelligence in junior high school students	Cross sectional study	The same as number 7
9	Academic achievement of children with pre anemic iron deficiency	To investigate the prevalence of pre anemic iron deficiency in school aged children and to determine whether this condition is at risk factor for low academic achievement	Cross sectional study	The same as number 7
10	Quality of home stimulation and language development in children aged 12-24 months living in orphanage and family home	To determine quality of home stimulation and language development and their correlation in children living in orphanage and family home	Cross sectional study	The same as number 7
11	Measuring language development in PDD and non PDD (pervasive development disorders)	To explore differences in receptive language, verbal expressive and non verbal expressive language between PDD and non PDD	Cross-sectional study	The same as number 7

Table 3 shows that (1) In each study number 1, 4 and 5, there was analysis of two variables and multiple variables, but in each study number 2, 3 and 6, there was only analysis of two variables; (2) In each study from number 1 to number 6, there was no discussion on quality and accuracy of data, causal relationship, and implication; and (3) There is link between conclusion and the type of study design in the study number 2 and 4, but no link between conclusion and the type of study design in the study number 1, 3, 5 and 6.

Table 3

The Title of Study by Methods (Analysis), Discussion, and Conclusion

No	Title of study	Methods		
		Analysis	Discussion	Conclusion
1	Reduced serum zinc levels while improving growth of underweight school children in trial of zinc fortified milk in Indonesia	Analysis of two variables using significance test: <i>t</i> -test and χ^2 test, Analysis of multiple variables: multiple logistic regression	No discussion on quality and accuracy of data, causal relationship and implication	Reduced mean serum zinc levels were observed in children who received standard milk, as well as who received zinc fortified milk
2	Effect of iron and zinc fortified milk supplementation on working memory of underweight poor urban	Analysis of two variables using significance test namely χ^2 and <i>t</i> test	The same as number 1	Milk fortified with iron and zinc improve working memory
3	Growth velocity in elementary school children with iron deficiency anemia after iron therapy	Analysis of two variables: <i>t</i> -test and Mann Whitney test	The same as number 1	There is significant difference in height but no significant difference between both group in growth velocity
4	Cognitive outcome in late preterm baby measured by orellem scale in three months connected age	Analysis of two variables: <i>t</i> -test, Mann Whitney test and χ^2 test Analysis of multiple variables: multiple logistic regression	The same as number 1	Cognitive out- come of late preterm babies was delayed compared to full term babies
5	Correlation between hyper bilirubin anemia in term Infants and development delay in 2-4 year old children	Analysis of two variables: to calculate relative risk, Analysis of multiple variables: multiple logistic regression	The same as number 1	There is relation- ship between hyper- bilirubinemia in infants and development delay in 2-4 year old children
6	Comparison of language and visual motor between exclusively and non exclusively breastfed infants through cognitive adaptive test, clinical linguistic, and antibody milestone scale	Analysis of two variables: χ^2 test, <i>t</i> -test and Mann Whitney test	The same as number 1	Exclusive breast- fed infants has higher language and visual motor developmental quotient score than non exclusively breastfed infants

Table 4 shows that (1) In each study from number 7 to 11, there is only analysis of one variable; (2) In each study from number 7 to 11, there is no discussion on quality and accuracy of data, causal relationship and implication; and (3) There is link between conclusion and study objective in research from number 8 to number 11, but in study number 7 the type of study design is not relevant.

Table 4

The Title of Study by Method (Analysis), Discussion, and Conclusion

No	Title of study	Methods		
		Analysis	Discussion	Conclusion
7	Breastfeeding and decreased for childhood obesity	Analysis of two variables: χ^2 test	No discussion on quality and accuracy data, causal relationship and implication	Exclusive infant breast feeding and longer duration breast feeding lowered the risk for childhood obesity in children aged 6-8 years

Table 4 continued

No	Title of study	Methods		
		Analysis	Discussion	Conclusion
8	Relationship between obesity and cognitive intelligence in junior high school students	Analysis of two variables Sommer's test	The same as number 7	Obesity has relationship with cognitive intelligence in junior high school students
9	Academic achievement of children with pre anemic iron deficiency	Analysis of two variables: χ^2 test and Fisher's exact test	The same as number 7	This study is able to determine whether pre anemic iron deficiency is the risk factor for academic achievement
10	Quality of home stimulation and language development in children aged 12-24 months living in orphanage and family home	Analysis of two variables: χ^2 test, Fischer exact test, Mann Whitney test, Pearson's product moment test	The same as number 7	The quality of home stimulation in orphanages, which result in a higher rate of language delay in children aged 12-24 months
11	Measuring language development in pervasive development disorders (PDD) and non PDD children	Analysis of two variables: χ^2 test and t test	The same as number 7	PDD children are more likely to have a delay in receptive language compare to non PDD children

Discussion

Intervention Study Producing Causal Relationship

Intervention studies which were used in study number 1, 2 and 3 produce causal relationship. Since there was no discussion on quality and accuracy of data, we do not know the level of α and β errors and how far the result of study from the sample to be generalized to certain population. Since there was no discussion on implication of study, the researchers did not make correct conclusion, recommendation and suggestion. For example research number 2, the researcher concluded that "milk fortified with iron and zinc improves working memory of underweight poor urban". This conclusion should be followed by recommendation namely (1) similar study has to be continued in the larger population from which a sample representative is taken with certain α error and β error; and (2) based on the continued study, recommendation is formulated to be a policy whether milk fortified iron and zinc is used to improve working memory for underweight children. Based on the recommendation, the researcher formulate several suggestions by conducting inter-discipline approach using the discipline of nutrition, paediatrics, economist to formulate suggestions of innovative work, as it is expected according to the IQF.

Observational Study Producing Causal Relationship

Observational studies which were used in study number 4, 5 and 6 produce causal relationship. Since there were no discussion on quality and accuracy of data, except for the research number 5, we do not know the level of α error and β error, and how far the result of study can be generalized to certain population. Since there was no discussion on implication of study, the researchers did not make correct conclusion, recommendation and suggestion. For example study number 5, the researcher concludes that there is relationship between hyper-bilirubinemia in term of infants and development delay in 2-4 year children. Because this study used retrospective cohort study, the conclusion should be as follows: hyper-bilirubinemia in term of infants influence development delay of 2-4 year children. This conclusion should be followed by recommendation namely (1) similar study has to be continued in the larger population from which a representative sample is taken; (2) if based on the continued study, the hypothesis is proved that hyper-bilirubinaemia cause development delay in 2-4 year children, the recommendation should be formulated as follows: hyper-bilirububinaemia in infants has

to be prevented before and after they were born. Based on the recommendation, the researcher conducts inter-discipline approach using the disciplines of paediatrics, obstetric-gynaecology, clinical pathologist, etc. to formulate several suggestions of innovative work, as it is expected according to the IQF.

Case Control and Cross Sectional Studies do not Produce Causal Relationship

Case control and cross sectional studies which were used in the study from number 7 to number 11 do not produce causal relationship directly. Since there are no discussion on quality and accuracy of data, we do not know the level of α error and β errors, and how far the result of study can be generalized to certain population. Since there was no discussion on causal relationship using Hill criteria especially for the case control and cross sectional studies, we do not know what independent variables influence each dependent variable in each study from number 7 to number 11. As a result, the conclusion of study can be made only as follows: “Non-exclusive breast feeding is the risk factor of obesity in children aged 6-8 years”, for study number 7; “obesity is the risk factor of cognitive intelligence in junior high school student” for study number 8; “there is no association between pre-anemic iron deficiency and low academic achievement” in study number 9 may be because of small sample size, “home stimulation is the risk factor of language delay in children aged 12-24 months” for study number 10, and “PDD is the risk factor for language development”, for the study number 11.

Conclusion

Based on the review of the 11 articles presented in Scientific Journal, IQF has not been applied because of some problems in research methods and IQF itself has not been socialized among researchers. We hope the readers especially publishers and researchers who had opportunity to read this literature review, may be stimulated how they contribute in the development of science in their field through research and inter-discipline and multi-discipline approach in producing innovative and tested work, as stated in the IQF.

References

- Beaglohole, R., Bonita, R., & Kjellstrom, T. (1993). *Basic epidemiology*. Geneva: World Health Organization.
- Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Tinggi. (2011). *Kerangka Nasional Indonesia (KKNI)*. Kajian tentang Implikasikan Strategi Implementasi KKNI, IQF Nasional.
- Fisher, A. et al. (1983). *Hanbook for family planning operations research design*. USA: Ppulation Council.
- Iskandar, A. (2010). Correlation between hyperbilirubinamia and development delay in 2-4 year old children. *Paediatr Indones*, 50(3), 54-58.
- Laila, I. (2012). Breastfeeding decreased risk for childhood obesity. *Paediatr Indones*, 52(1), 1-5.
- Lapau, B. (2012). *Prinsip dan metode epidemiologi*. Jakarta: Balai Penerbit FKUI.
- Lapau, B. (2013). *Metode penelitian kesehatan, metode ilmiah penulisan skripsi, tesis dan disertasi*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.
- Lapau, B. (2015). *Metode penelitian kebidanan, panduan penulisan protokol dan hasil penelitian*. Jakarta: Yayasan Pustaka Obor Indonesia.
- Lestari, E. D., Lilisianawati, B. S., Lestarina, L., & Salimo, H. (2012). Reduced serum zinc levels while improving growth of underweight school children in trial of zinc fortified milk in Indonesia. *Paediatr Indones*, 52(2), 118-124.
- Lyfia, D., Deliana, M., Hakimi, R. N., & Lubis, B. (2009). Growth velocity in elementary school children iron deficiency anemia after iron therapy. *Paediatr Indones*, 49(5), 249-252.
- Montolalu, N., Tangkilisan, H. A., & Nelly, M. (2009). Relationship between obesity and cognitive intelligence in junior high school students. *Paediatr Indones*, 49(3), 165-168.
- Nugroho, H. W., Lestari, E. D., Salimo, H., Dewi, M., Adhim, Z. N., & Lestarina, L. (2010). Effects of iron and zinc fortified milk supplementation on working memory of underweight poor urban school children: A randomized double blnd trial. *Jakarta: Paediatr Indones*, 50(2), 92-95.

- Pardede, P. W., Windiastuti, E., & Tridjja, B. (2009). Academic achievement of elementary school aged children with pre-anemic iron-deficiency. *Paediatr Indones*, 49(4), 209-213.
- Rano, T. (2009). Quality of home stimulation and language development in children aged 12-24 months living in orphanages and family homes. *Paediatr Indones*, 48(1), 1-6.
- Samsudin, U. (2009). Comparison of language and visual motor between exclusively and non-exclusively breastfed infants through cognitive adaptive test and clinical linguistic and antibody milestone scale. *Paediatr Indones*, 49(6), 337-441.
- Setyorini, A., Umboh, A., & Haksari, E. L. (2010). Cognitive outcome in late preterm baby measured by Mullen Scale in three month corrected age. *Paediatr Indones*, 50(4), 239-244.
- World Health Organization. (1986). *Sample size determination, a user's manual*. Epidemiological and Statistical Methodology Unit. Geneva: WHO
- Yuridyah, P. M., Soedjatmiko, & Sastroasmoro, S. (2009). Quality of home stimulation and language development in children aged 12-24 months living in orphanages and family homes. *Paediatr Indones*, 48(1), 25-32.